



14TH NYAYAVALOKAN TRIAL ADVOCACY AND JUDGMENT WRITING COMPETITION, 2025-26



TRIAL PROBLEM



14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

TRIAL ADVOCACY PROBLEM:

State of Maharashtra vs. Malini Jagdish Thorat

In the Court of the Principal Sessions Judge at, Mumbai

List of Documents

1. First Information Report (Exhibit no. 1)
2. Statements under s.180 of BNSS
3. Scene of Offence Panchnama (Exhibit no. 2)
4. Post-mortem Examination Report of Namrata Thorat (Exhibit no. 3)
5. CA Toxicology Report - Urine, Blood, Viscera of Namrata Thorat (Exhibit no. 4)
(to be proved by Prosecution)
- CA Toxicology Report – Bedsheet and Bottle of Madhu Phenol (Exhibit no. 5) (to be proved by Prosecution)
6. Letter from Rupesh Sanjay Athalye (to be proved by Defence)

List of Appendices:

1. Statements of Defence Witnesses.

2025-26



14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

EXHIBIT NO. 1:

FIRST INFORMATION REPORT

(under Section 173 BNSS)

1. District: Mumbai. P.S: Mahim Police Station Year: 2025
FIR No: 226 of 2025
Date of occurrence: 20th May 2025
2. Act: Bharatiya Nyaya Sanhita, 2023 Sections: 108
3. Occurrence of Offence, Day: Tuesday, 20th May 2025 Time: 11.30 am
4. Information recorded at PS: Date: 20th May 2025 Time: 2.00 pm
General Diary Reference Entry No: 1324/2025
Information recorded by: Police Inspector J.T. Sawant
5. Type of information: Personal Written / Oral: *Oral*
6. Place of Occurrence: Direction / Distance from PS: Flat 301, Utpal Park B wing.
Dharmaveer Sambhaji Raje Marg, Mahim. 2.8 km south of police station
7. Informant Name: Varsha Vinay Thorat
Husbands name: Vinay Thorat
Date of birth: 27 April.1954
Nationality: Indian
Occupation: Retired school teacher
8. Address: Flat 301, Utpal Park B wing. Dharmaveer Sambhaji Raje Marg, Mahim,
Mumbai 400016
9. Basis on which FIR is lodged: Information provided by Varsha Vinay Thorat
10. Details of Known / Unknown / Suspected accused with particulars:
Malini Jagdish Thorat, D.O.B. 6 December 1974, Indian, widow of Jagdish Thorat
9. Reasons for delay in reporting by informant: - no delay, informed immediately
10. Particulars of injuries sustained: *As per post-mortem report.*
11. Particulars of the post mortem report: *As per post-mortem report.*
12. Inquest report / Unnatural death case no. if any:

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

FIR read over to the complainant/informant, admitted to be correctly recorded and a copy given to the complainant/informant free of cost.

13. Signature/thumb impression of complainant/informant:

Signed Varsha Vijay Thorat

Signature of Officer-in-charge, Police station:

Signed PI JT Sawant

Date and time of dispatch to the Court: 21st May 2025 at 1.30 pm



14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

PW 1 – SHRIMATI VARSHA VIJAY THORAT (INFORMANT)

Age: 71 years

Occupation: Retired school teacher

Address: Flat 301, Utpal Park B wing. Dharmaveer Sambhaji Raje Marg, Mahim, Mumbai 400016

STATEMENT: I am 71 years old and I am now retired. I used to be a school teacher at Victoria High School, which is near my home. I now live with my daughter-in-law Malini and grand-daughter Namrata.

In 2003, my son Jagdish, married Malini, and they came to live with us. They met at work, had a love marriage and seemed very happy. In March 2006 they had a baby girl called Namrata. My husband Vijay was already unwell and suffering from cancer and so he had stopped working and used to be at home all the time. I was still working at that time. Jagdish was in the financial sector working with Punjab National Bank, which is where he had met Malini. They had jointly decided that after the baby was born it would be better for Malini to stay home, look after the baby and help care for my husband. Vijay passed away in November 2006.

After my husband passed away, Jagdish started drinking excessively and seemed to be in a depression. We tried getting help for Jagdish but he got worse, stopped seeing the doctors, would not take his medicines and spent most of his spare time outside the house. He was not interested in his daughter any more either. I would hear them arguing at night when Namrata was asleep. They were barely speaking any more. The whole atmosphere in the house was very depressing. Malini and I spoke about what was happening and we hoped he would pull out of it, but 16 months later he lost his job. That is when the fighting became unbearable, and Namrata would cry a lot since she could feel the tension and was only 2 years old. There was tremendous financial strain on the family. Malini went back to work in the bank in September and I took retirement and started home tuitions so I could help with Namrata. Malini found out that Jagdish was borrowing money from friends to keep drinking, since Malini had been very clear that she would not give him any money. In April

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

2009 he collapsed at his friend's house, he was admitted to hospital and diagnosed with severe liver cirrhosis. His medical bills were growing and Malini and I were finding it very difficult to manage, especially balancing work, caring for Namrata and looking after Jagdish. On 4th May 2009, Jagdish passed away. I was devastated, but very grateful that Malini decided to continue to stay with me so that Namrata had some stability.

In the initial years, after Jagdish passed away, Malini hardly had time with Namrata because she had been promoted and travel and work had become very demanding, and I knew she needed the work to bring up Namrata. Malini was also clearing all Jagdish's debts in those initial years. I had also helped her with my savings of Rs.15 lacs. She tried very hard to balance everything at the time.

Namrata joined Victoria High School in June 2010, where I used to teach. Malini was very strict with Namrata and would always tell her she needed to study very hard because that was the only way she could make something of her life. I started to notice that with time Malini had become very bitter and hardly smiled any more. She was always reprimanding Namrata about her grades and forcing her to study when she was only in primary school. Those years with Malini working and caring for Namrata were very tough financially, and Namrata was an average student, so she always needed some tuitions. When Namrata reached Std. 9 Malini became even worse and was always hounding Namrata when she was home, shouting at her, never giving her any love or kind words. She would not allow Namrata to go out with her friends or attend birthday parties or sleep overs.

On Namrata's 16th birthday I gave her a cell phone as a gift. Malini was very angry with me and she informed Namrata that she would take it away and only allow her 30 minutes usage in the evening after she had shown her mother that all her homework was done. Namrata, being a teenager, started getting into horrible screaming matches with her mother every night. I would try to mediate, but Malini always told me to get out, that I was spoiling Namrata like I had spoiled Jagdish, and that she was picking up all the pieces of the irresponsible Thorat house. I used to feel very bad and started staying in my room when Malini was at home. Namrata and I continued to be close. A lot of the times when Namrata got home from school it would be just us at lunch and she would tell me all her school

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

gossip and stories. We would all eat dinner together after Malini got home from work, and she would always be discussing the financial burden of bringing up Namrata as a single parent. She would complain about the cost of Namrata's clothes, her fees, and her tuitions. Poor Namrata would always try to be mature with her mother and explain how one day she will pay all the money back, but Malini would make fun of her and say with her marks she will be lucky to even end up with a maid's job. When Malini spoke to Namrata in this rude and insulting manner, Namrata would come to my room and cry and bitterly complain that she was fed up of the way her mother ridiculed her from the time she was a child and would often tell me that her mother had communicated to her that she would be a lot happier if she did not have her responsibility. I will never forget, when Namrata was in the 12th Std., she worked really hard and managed to get a first-class result, but Malini was not satisfied and punished Namrata, refusing to let her go for the post-results class party. I felt very bad for the child. I found Namrata to be very withdrawn and she would spend most of her time staring into space. When I asked her why she was so depressed, she initially refused to answer me, but when I insisted, she bitterly started sobbing and told me that her mother kept telling her that she was a burden on her and that it would have been better if she had not given birth to her.

Malini managed to secure a seat at C.S. Manchanda College for Namrata to complete her B.Sc. in Chemistry. At this time Malini allowed Namrata to have her phone all the time because she needed to travel alone. In that first year of college, after Malini slept, Namrata would come to my room and we would secretly watch crime shows and she would tell me about her college life. She was a good girl and did not party like the other college girls. During the college fest in her first year of college, Namrata met Rupesh, who was one year senior to her at college. She told me about it after a few months and told me they were secretly dating. I was concerned that we did not know this boy. I asked her to tell her mother but she refused. Once she secretly spoke to Rupesh while with me, so I got to see the boy. He was very polite and respectful.

In December-January, Namrata started skipping college and spending time with Rupesh. She got into attendance problems and Malini was asked to come and meet the Department

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

Head in early February this year because Namrata was on the blacklist for poor attendance and would be debarred from taking her final exams. When Malini came home from the college meeting she was very angry with Namrata. She slapped her across the face in front of me and told her that she was not worth anything and Malini had sacrificed so much to educate her and it was all being wasted and 'spat on' by Namrata. Namrata was crying and she locked herself in her bedroom. I was very upset with Malini and reprimanded her. I told her that she had become very harsh with the child and she needed to give Namrata a chance to explain what was happening rather than always yelling at her. Malini was furious with me and got up and went to work, she did not seem to care the child was upset. After a few hours I knocked on Namrata's door and begged to be let in so we could talk and I could feed her. She always loved having lunch with me. It was our special time together. She let me in and we spoke for a long time. Namrata said she felt very bad but she was so unhappy at home she did not want to be home and just wanted to get away with Rupesh. I reasoned with her about how important her studies were for her future. She slowly came round and ate with me and when her mother came home in the evening she refused to speak with her. After this incident, Namrata would go to college daily, she studied, she came home in the evenings but rarely spoke to anyone. She told me she felt hopeless and that she was just a burden to everyone. Nothing I could do seemed to give the child peace.

On 16th May 2025, Malini was unwell with a cold and had taken the day off from work. Namrata came home early from college, distraught. She looked like she had been crying. I asked her what was wrong and she quietly came and told me that Rupesh had received his admission letter for University of Michigan and he would be leaving soon to complete his Master's degree. At that time she told me that since Rupesh is now going to Michigan University, she felt abandoned and told me that now she had no reason whatsoever to live. I informed Malini that I was concerned about Namrata and she replied "Who knows what she is up to, she must have gotten into some trouble, as usual, and I am not going after her to clean up her mess. I don't care anymore".

All weekend Namrata was in her room and only came out for meals. She had her phone on silent and refused to take any calls, even when I went to sit with her she was lying down

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

staring at the ceiling and the phone was ringing. I told her it was Rupesh who had repeatedly been calling, she still did not move or take the call. I tried to reason with her about Rupesh needing to leave for higher studies that it was a good thing and that she will see him in the vacations. Meanwhile she can focus on her own studies and make a life for herself. She seemed unwilling to hear reason at that time.

Yesterday morning, 19th May 2025, Namrata got up and was leaving the house without telling anyone when Malini came out for breakfast. She asked Namrata where she was going so early and Namrata told her that results were coming out today so she was headed to college. Malini ordered her to come back as soon as she had her marks. The time was about 7.45 am. Malini said she was going to the Gym, as usual, and would be back and go to work post lunch after meeting Namrata. I was in my room all morning. I was very worried. At about 11.30 am Namrata returned. I ran out to meet her. She looked dazed. She said she had failed one of her chemistry papers and said, “now I know I am finished with Mama, she will kill me! And I really don’t care anymore”. I was in tears at her distress but before I could say anything Malini joined us and asked Namrata her results. Namrata said she had got 51% in paper 1 and 38% in paper 2. I have never seen Malini so angry in all these years. She started screaming at Namrata, very loudly, threatened to throw her out of the house because she was sick and tired of wasting her time supporting her loser daughter who would make nothing of her life and be a burden to everyone forever. She picked up the table knife and was waving it in front of Namrata screaming, “kill me and kill yourself, end this pain and suffering for both of us”. Namrata was sobbing and kept saying ‘Ok Mama, if this will make you happy and give you peace.’ Hearing this response from Namrata I was chilled to my bones, and was yelling at both of them to stop this madness. I tried to take the knife away from Malini’s hand as she was attempting to push it in Namrata’s hand, and calm Malini down but she was out of control and pushed me onto a chair. I was very shaken but tried to catch Namrata and shelter her from this madness of Malini. I am not very strong so Namrata pulled away and ran into her room and locked the door. I tried to reason with Malini and asked her to speak to Namrata. She refused, and said, “I don’t care even if she dies”. She went to her room, collected her office bag and left.

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

I was shaking with fear and shock. I stayed outside Namrata's room and kept knocking but got no reply. I told her that Malini had left and it was safe to come out. I called her phone, but she disconnected my call.

Namrata did not come out of her room all day on Monday and when Malini came home in the evening I told her I was really worried about Namrata as she had not come out for food all day. Malini told me not to waste my time worrying as Namrata was probably just sulking because she had been reprimanded "just like a typical teenager". We both had dinner in silence. Namrata did not come for dinner. I waited for Malini to go into her room and then I continued to knock on Namrata's door till about 1 am in the morning. I got no reply. She had stopped even disconnecting my calls after 10 pm this evening. I was exhausted so I decided to make her favourite 2 min Maggi noodles and keep them in the microwave ready for her if she was hungry. I went to sleep at about 1.30 am, hoping maybe when everyone is asleep Namrata will come and eat.

This morning, when I woke up, the first thing I did was check the microwave. The food had not been touched. I felt bad and started again knocking on her door and calling her. But I got no reply. I was very worried but also very scared of Malini's rage if I interfered too much. When Malini came out for her tea at 8 am I told her that Namrata had still not unlocked the door and come out, nor had she eaten anything for almost 24 hrs now. Malini again reprimanded me for meddling and did not seem at all concerned. She got ready and left for office by 9.30 am.

After Malini left for work, I got ready and cooked Namrata's favourite lunch. I sent her a WhatsApp message to let her know we could be alone together and I had made pau bhaji, her favourite, for lunch – I begged her to please open the door and let me in. Since she had yet not opened the door, and nor had she read my WhatsApp message, at about 11 am I called Mrs. Sinha, our neighbour in Flat 302, to come over, as I needed her help. Pratima came over immediately and I told her what had transpired. She was very upset to hear about the terrible incident with Malini telling Namrata to kill herself. We kept knocking on Namrata's bedroom door but there was no reply. Pratima suggested we call her driver to help us break open the door. When we broke the door and went inside Namrata was lying

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

on her bed. Her eyes were closed; she had some white stains around her mouth and she appeared not to be breathing. I was screaming and crying and I shook Namrata to try and wake her. I searched the bed to see what she had taken; I could not find anything except some very smelly vomit on the bed next to her head. I stayed with Namrata. I recall hearing Pratima speaking to Malini to inform her about Namrata.

I suggested we take Namrata to the hospital for medical help, but Pratima said that according to her she was already dead and it is best we call the police. This was all Malini's fault, is all I kept thinking. I was very upset. I cannot recall what time Malini returned home. Malini saw her own child lying there and did not even show any shock or sorrow. She just asked if we had called the police.

At about 12:15 pm Inspector Patil from Mahim Police Station came in response to the phone call. He was accompanied by other police constables. They started making inquiries. PI Patil spoke to Malini and our neighbour Pratima Sinha. He asked me if I needed medical attention, I declined. Constable Meera was with me all the time while I sat with Namrata I kept on telling Malini that it was only because of her ill treatment towards her daughter and her behaviour when Namrata got her results, that drove my poor grand-daughter to commit suicide. After some time, PI Patil asked me if I was willing to have my statement recorded since I was the one who discovered Namrata's body. I agreed.

After a short time my statement was recorded by PI J.T.Sawant, read over by me, and I confirm it has been correctly recorded.

Sd/-

PI JT Sawant

Sd/-

Varsha Vijay Thorat

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

PW 2 – SR. P.I. BHARAT PATIL: Mahim Police Station, Mori Road, Near Mahim Church and Old Mahim Fort, Mumbai 400016

STATEMENT: I was on patrol duty on 20th May 2025, when I heard a distress call on the police wireless regarding the death of a young girl in Utpal Park. The time was about 12.00 pm on 20th May 2025. Since I was already on rounds, I decided to inspect myself. I called for Constable Suresh Mhatre, Constable N. Jayant, API Mane and Constable Meera to meet me at Utpal Park in case I needed assistance. I also called for a doctor and ambulance from Bhabha Hospital since I was informed that the incident involved a young girl.

When I reached Utpal Park – B Wing, I met the watchman of the building. He was unaware of any incident in Flat 301. He called on the intercom and then informed me that I could proceed to Flat 301 as they were expecting me. I reached the flat by lift and walked to the flat. I rang the doorbell. A middle-aged lady opened the door. She looked very scared. She identified herself as Mrs. Pratima Sinha, the next-door neighbour from Flat 302. I asked her if there had been an incident in this Flat as someone had called the police station requesting assistance. Mrs. Pratima said she had called to report the death of a young girl Namrata who lives in this Flat with her mother and grandmother. She informed me that she had called the Police because the grandmother had asked her to. She said she knew nothing about the incident and was only responding to a panicked call from the grandmother at about 11.15 am asking for help with her grand-daughter, so she responded. By this time Constable Suresh, Constable Jayant and Constable Meera also reached the spot. I asked Constable Jayant and Constable Meera to accompany me inside the Flat. I asked Constable Suresh to identify two reliable panchas as witnesses for investigation purposes and to inform the building society manager that he must stay on the premises as we will need to question him. I asked Constable Jayant to stay near the door of the Flat and to ensure nobody exited or entered the Flat premises. Constable Meera and I were discussing with Mrs. Pratima, when another lady, younger, wearing office clothes came out of the bedroom, came up to me very calmly and introduced herself as the mother of the child who had

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

committed suicide. She said she was Mrs. Malini Jagdish Thorat, a single parent, whose daughter Namrata was 19 years old and had committed suicide. I immediately asked to be guided to the room.

On entering the bedroom I noticed that the door had been damaged and appeared to be broken. The room was in an orderly state. On the bed there was the body of a young girl, and an elderly lady sat next to her holding her hand and crying. Mrs. Malini introduced the old lady as her mother-in-law, Varsha Vinay Thorat, who lived with them. I immediately went to check if the girl was alive. She was not breathing. She was fully clothed in jeans and yellow coloured T-shirt. She had some white stain near her mouth and on the bed near her. Her eyes were shut. There appeared to be no injury marks on the body of Namrata Thorat, the victim. I examined the bed and side table for any signs of drugs or poisons. There was nothing apparent. She had a Bluetooth speaker with some English music playing, her mobile phone (brand One Plus) was near her right hand. On the side table near her bed, I observed a full bottle of water and 5-6 bottles of coloured nail paint. Her desk had some stationary and a lamp. The surface was clean. In the desk drawer constable Suresh found a note. I opened the note and it was a letter addressed to Namrata from a Mr. Rupesh. Her college bag was packed and lying on her desk chair. The room was very tidy. The room had an attached washroom and balcony. I proceeded to the balcony and examined the area – there was nothing except some plants and gardening tools. I went into the washroom and looked for drugs or poisons, and found toiletries that girls use, cleaning materials and some discarded towels on the floor. I also found an empty bottle of 'Madhu Phenol', which bottle was lying on the floor under the basin and the cap of the bottle was lying on the basin.

I started questioning the mother, Mrs. Malini as to the details leading up to the incident. She informed me that her daughter Namrata was mentally unstable and had been suffering from severe depression and appeared to have taken her own life. She said that she was not present at the time as she had to go to work at REB Bank, Mahim Branch, which was a 10 min drive from the house. She was the Mahim Branch Manager. She informed me that she

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

had left for work late that day because Namrata seemed unwell and she was concerned. She stated that after ensuring she was safe with her grandmother she left. She informed me that the first news she got about the incident was when the neighbour from flat 302 Pratima Sinha called from her mother-in-law's phone informing her that Namrata was lying dead in her bedroom. She said she asked Mrs. Pratima to call for an ambulance immediately so they could help the daughter, and then she left her office by taxi and rushed home. She said she had just reached home and gone in to see her child when I arrived at the spot. She said she herself was not aware of the details of what transpired at the time of Namrata's death.

At approximately 12.45 pm I was informed that the ambulance and doctor from Bhabha Hospital had arrived. I led them to the bedroom where the girl Namrata was lying. Dr. Nishit examined Namrata and pronounced her dead. While they were preparing the body challan for removing the body to Bhabha Hospital for post mortem, I continued to speak with the mother Mrs Malini. She informed me that Namrata had not been feeling well lately and that she had been depressed and upset about her exam results. She was not aware about Namrata's friends or social life. She informed me that she was always working and she hardly saw Namrata most days. She informed me that her mother-in-law was always taking care of Namrata since she was a small girl and Mrs. Malini was forced to go to work after her husband's death. She informed me that she had no knowledge about the letter on Namrata's desk, nor did she have knowledge who this person Rupesh was.

I asked the grandmother, Mrs Varsha Thorat if she would be willing to give a statement at the police station so an investigation into the death could be initiated. She agreed to go and give her statement. I requested Constable Meena to accompany Mrs Varsha Vijay Thorat to the police station so that she could lodge an FIR and her statement could be recorded. They left at about 1.20 pm. By this time the doctor who had come along with the ambulance i.e. Dr. Nishit, was ready to shift the body to the morgue for post-mortem examination. I signed the necessary release documents and they left. I asked constable Jayesh to accompany the body to the Hospital. It was about 2.30pm.

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

Constable Suresh returned with two witnesses. Mr. Arun Mandlik and Mr. Kumar, both residents of Utpal Park A-Wing, both had agreed to be panch witnesses. Since the FIR had been lodged, Constable Suresh and I began recording the spot panchnama, in the presence of the two panch witnesses. We observed some vomit on the bedding where Ms Namrata had been lying. We collected the stained bedsheet. From the bathroom I collected the empty bottle of 'Madhu Phenol' along with the cap. Both the bedsheet and the empty bottle of 'Madhu Phenol' along with the cap were put in two separate green coloured envelopes, closed and tied with jute string and sealed with the seal of our Police Station. The Panch Witnesses and I signed on the label pasted on both these envelopes.

I requested the mother Mrs. Malini to remain available for further questioning and on completion of the Spot Panchnama, I went back to the police station, where I ascertained the FIR No. and wrote the same on the labels affixed on the two exhibits marked 'A' and 'B' collected by me. Both the articles that had been taken charge of by me, were deposited in the Malkhana after entering in the Malkhana Register.

I then proceeded to Bhabha Hospital with Constable Suresh to enquire about the post-mortem. The time was 6.30 pm. I spoke with Dr. V.V. Harsh who was the doctor in-charge. He informed me that they had completed post-mortem examination of Ms Namrata Thorat, and that the approximate time since death was between 12-14 hrs prior to the post-mortem, and based upon initial examination it appeared that Ms Namrata had consumed some type of acid poison, the final report being kept pending for Toxicology from FSL Mumbai. I left Constable Suresh at the hospital to await the post-mortem specimens to be collected for submission to FSL and I returned to the police station.

Mrs. Varsha Vijay Thorat had completed giving her statement. On the basis of her statement that her daughter-in-law had instigated Namrata to commit suicide and the preliminary post-mortem finding that death was on account of consumption of poison, the FIR was lodged u/s 108 BNS, 2023 against Mrs. Malini Thorat. I returned to flat 301 Utpal Park –

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

B wing. I asked Mrs Malini to accompany me to the police station as she was required for further questioning regarding the suicide of her daughter. She was placed under arrest at about 8 p.m. on the same day, and subsequently produced in Court under remand on 21st May, 2025. She procured bail from the Court of Sessions, Greater Mumbai on 23rd May, 2025.

On 23rd May 2025, I had all 7 articles delivered to FSL, Mumbai for examination (2 articles from the spot and 5 articles from the post-mortem conducted on Ms Namrata Thorat). I recorded the statements of other witnesses and continued my investigation.

On 24th June, 2025 I collected the Post-Mortem Report with final opinion on cause of death of Ms Namrata Thorat from Bhabha Hospital and the Chemical Examination Report from FSL, Mumbai. The doctor's opinion was that deceased Ms Namrata Thorat died due to complications from carbolic acid (phenol) poisoning.

On completion of the investigation, I filed the chargesheet against Mrs. Malini Jagdish Thorat u/s 108 BNS on 7th August, 2025.

nyayaavalokan
2025-26

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

PW 3 – SHRI SUNIL JADHAV INGALE

Age: 41 years

Occupation: Forensic Scientist, Asst Chemical Analyzer – Toxicology Division

Address: State Directorate of Forensic Science Laboratories, Vidyanagari, Kalina, Santacruz East, Mumbai 400098

STATEMENT: I am a forensic scientist working in the Forensic Toxicology Division of the State Directorate of Forensic Laboratories in Kalina. I have been working at the lab for the past 16 years. I live in Room No 12/D Rehmat Manzil, Rehmat Nagar Road, Nalasopara (East) with my family. I have completed my MSc Analytical Chemistry and MPSC exam and then I was recruited to the Mumbai FSL Toxicology Division in September 2009. I joined as a Scientific Assistant and now I am Asst. Director Toxicology Division.

On 23rd May 2025, I was informed at 5 pm that some exhibits had been brought to the Receiving Unit from Mahim Police Station and that they pertained to a probable suicide, and I was required to examine the exhibits. Since it was already 5 pm I told the Receiving Unit that I would not take possession as the documentation would take time, but I would begin the analysis the next working day.

On 27th May, 2025, I collected the exhibits from the Receiving Unit with the forwarding letters from the IO of Mahim Police Station. The exhibits were sealed bearing stamp of Mahim Police Station and signatures of IO Patil from Mahim Police Station and Panchas and from Dr. V.V. Harsh from Bhabha Hospital. I proceeded with the parcels to my Department where I examined the forwarding letters:

One parcel contained two exhibits of Case No. CR 226/2025.

Second parcel contained five exhibits of ML Case No. 42/25.

Both were dated and signed on 20th May 2025.

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

LIST OF EXHIBITS BELOW:

- CR#226/2025 Exh(A) - one sealed bottle labelled bedsheet with stain
- CR#226/2025 Exh(B) – one bottle of 1 ltr. Madhu Phenol
- MLC 42/25 Exh (1) – one vial labelled deceased Namrata Thorat urine sample
- MLC 42/25 Exh (2) – one bottle labelled deceased Namrata Thorat stomach and its contents
- MLC 42/25 Exh (3) – one bottle labelled deceased Namrata Thorat portion of liver and half each kidney
- MLC 42/25 Exh (4) – one vial labelled deceased Namrata Thorat blood 30 mL in sodium fluoride and saturated sodium chloride
- MLC 42/25 Exh (5) – one parcel labelled jeans pant, yellow t-shirt, white undergarment of deceased Namrata Thorat

I visually examined **CR#226/2025 Exh (A)** – it contained few dried white coloured particles in a stain. I noted the colour, smell and nature of the stain. I performed chemical tests. The stain showed presence of carbolic acid.

I examined the contents of **CR#226/2025 Exh (B)** – the ‘Madhu Phenol’ bottle had a few drops of clear liquid. The smell of the contents of the bottle were sickly sweet. I tested one drop of the liquid and was able to confirm that the bottle had contained carbolic acid.

I examined **MLC 42/25 Exh(1)** – the vial contained 15 ml of urine of deceased Namrata Thorat. I noted the colour, smell and nature of the urine. I performed chemical tests. The urine showed presence of carbolic acid.

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

I examined **MLC 42/25 Exh (2) and Exh (3)** – the bottles contained the viscera of deceased Namrata Thorat. I noted the weight, colour, smell of the viscera. I performed chemical tests. The viscera showed presence of carbolic acid.

I examined **MLC 42/25 Exh (4)** – the vial contained 30 ml of blood with preservative of deceased Namrata Thorat. I noted the colour, smell, nature of the blood. I performed chemical tests. The blood showed presence of carbolic acid.

I examined **MLC 42/25 Exh (5)** – it contained the clothes of deceased Namrata Thorat. There was one jean pant of size S, one yellow coloured t-shirt of size S, one white undergarment. I examined all the cloths. No stains were present on the jeans and white undergarment. On yellow t-shirt one large stain was noted on right shoulder. I cut that stain and conducted chemical tests. The stain showed presence of carbolic acid.

On the basis of above-named examinations, I documented my findings and issued the Report. I completed my examination on 29th May 2025. I resealed all the exhibits and returned them to the Receiving Unit on 30th May 2025.

EXHIBIT No. 2:

SCENE OF OFFENCE PANCHNAMA

NB. This document alongwith the articles seized under this Panchanama shall be taken as proved by the Prosecution and no articles seized herein will be given to the Participants for the purpose of showing any witness.

Panch No. 1

Date: 20th May 2025

Mr. Arun Mandlik, age 54 years

Occupation: Family Business

Residing at: Flat 601, Utpal Park A-wing. Dharmaveer Sambhaji Raje Marg, Mahim, Mumbai 400016

Panch No. 2

Mr. Kumar, age 31 years

Occupation: Fitness coach

Residing at: Flat 101, Utpal Park A-wing. Dharmaveer Sambhaji Raje Marg, Mahim, Mumbai 400016

We the above-named panchas were called by Constable Suresh at about 12.30 pm on 20th May 2025 to the neighbouring Utpal Park B-wing, 3rd floor, Flat 301 where a young girl had been found dead in her locked bedroom and so he requested us to act as panchas for conducting the spot panchnama. We agreed to act as panchas. When we reached there, Sr. PI Patil was present along with one API Mane and Constable Jayant was guarding the access to the flat.

The said Flat No 301 is a 3-bedroom hall apartment. As you enter the Flat there is a hall measuring 20ft X 15 ft. and there is an adjoining terrace, the doors are open. There are two chairs and a table on the terrace. Towards the south west corner of this hall, on the right hand

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

side is a large kitchen. On the same right hand side but towards the northwest direction is one bedroom. The bedroom belongs to Mrs Malini Jagdish Thorat, there is a second bedroom nearby which belongs to Mrs. Varsha Vinay Thorat. Opposite to the kitchen is a third bedroom which belongs to Ms. Namrata Thorat.

This third bedroom of Ms. Namrata Thorat is where the police took us. The door was open. It appeared like the door had been broken open because damage to the doorframe was visible. The bedroom measures 10 ft X 12 ft. To the right side of the room is a bed with side table. On the left side of the room there is one wooden cupboard, then there is the door to the attached bathroom, and then there is a wooden coloured desk. On the far side there are windows and one door leading out to a small balcony with some plants.

We were led to the balcony area. There were some plants and gardening tools. We returned inside and were directed to the bathroom. There were some toiletries on a shelf, some cleaning materials under the sink in a bucket and one large brown towel lying on the floor. We also found a nearly empty bottle of 'Madhu Phenol', which bottle was lying on the floor under the basin and the cap of the bottle was lying on the basin.

We returned to the bedroom and were led to the desk. The desk has some stationary items and one lamp. There is nothing else on the desk. On the desk chair there is one black back-pack which is closed. In front of us Constable Suresh opened the drawer of the desk. The drawer contained stationary items and charging cables. One folded letter was lying in the drawer. Constable Suresh opened the letter in front of us and read it. He showed it to IO Patil in front of us. When Mrs. Varsha Thorat who was sitting near her grand-daughter was asked about this letter from one Rupesh, she said he was Namrata's boy-friend.

We proceeded to the bed area. Lying on the bed is a female. She is fully clothed. She appears to be a young adult. She is lying on her side. She is identified as Ms Namrata Thorat, d/o Malini Jagdish Thorat and late Jagdish Thorat. There is a blue colour JBL speaker next to her head and

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

a mobile phone of brand One Plus. Near the mouth of the body there were some white stains. The bedsheet near the mouth of the body also had similar looking white stains. To the left of the bed, on the table there is a bottle of water and 5 bottles of coloured nail paint.

API Mane seized, sealed and marked the following two items in our presence and the presence of Insp Patil:

1. CR#226/2025 Exh (A) the white stained area of the bedsheet was cut out.
2. CR#226/2025 Exh (B) the almost empty bottle of 'Madhu Phenol' with cap.

Both the bedsheet and the bottle of 'Madhu Phenol' along with the cap were put in two separate green coloured envelopes, closed and tied with jute string and sealed with the seal of Mahim Police Station. We Panch Witnesses along with Sr. P.I. Patil signed on the label pasted on both these envelopes. Except for the above articles nothing else was seized by the police in our presence.

The panchnama was conducted in a peaceful manner and it was completed at about 2:15 pm, on 20th May, 2025. The panchnama was written by Constable Suresh. Both of us panchas have read the contents of the panchnama. The same is correctly recorded.

Signed PI Bharat Patil

Signed Panch No 1

2025-26

Signed Panch No 2

EXHIBIT No. 3:

POST MORTEM REPORT

Post Mortem Findings for Case No: CR#226/2025

ML Case No. 42/25

Body Identified by: Mother, Malini Jagdish Thorat

Date and Hour of Starting Autopsy: 20th May 2025, 3:05pm

Date and Hour of Concluding Autopsy: 20th May 2025, 4:45pm

1. Name of Deceased: Ms Namrata Thorat
2. D/o: Late Mr. Jagdish Thorat Age: 19 yrs Sex: Female

Address: Flat 301, Utpal Park B-wing, Mahim, Mumbai 400016
3. Height: 167 cms Weight: 57 kgs Physique: Healthy
4. Special Identification Features: mole on chin
5. Deceased body apparels: Blue jeans pant, Yellow T-shirt, White undergarment
6. Post-mortem changes present: post-mortem lividity could not be appreciated due to the dark complexion of the deceased. Rigor mortis was present all over the body.
7. External Appearance: Conjunctive of both eyes were pale. Oral mucosa showed discolouration. White residue present near lips. Lips and tongue were charred black in colour. Bluish discolouration was present over the nail beds of all fingers. All other natural orifices were unremarkable.
8. Injuries: No other injuries were seen on the body.
9. Internal:

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

- a. **Cranium & Spinal Canal:** Scalp, Skull, Spine intact, Brain weighed 1050gm, intact and congested. Cut section showed multiple petechial haemorrhages in the white matter
- b. **Thorax:** Walls, Ribs, Pleural Cavity intact. Larynx intact showed blackish discolouration & froth. Trachea intact and contained whitish froth. Right lung weighed 655 gms, congested, blood stained froth on cut section. Left lung weighed 670 gm, congested, blood stained froth on cut section. Heart weighed 245 gms, intact. Large vessels intact.
- c. **Abdomen:** Peritoneum crumbly, dark brown discolouration with 450 ml of brownish coloured peritoneal fluid. Mouth-Pharynx-Oesophagus shows corroded tongue with black discolouration, soft, crumbly pharynx oesophagus with black discolouration. Signs of corrosion in oesophagus. Stomach weighed 550gms, black in colour, soft and crumbly, internally fully corroded, thickened black lining. Large perforation in stomach with burnt smell. Intestines are soft, distended, crumbly at some areas. Liver weighs 965gms with brownish discolouration. Spleen weighed 100gms and crumbly. Adrenals were intact but haemorrhagic. Pancreas intact with black discolouration.
- d. **Genito-Urinary organs:** right kidney weighed 130gms, intact, cut section pale. Left kidney weighed 150gms, intact, cut section pale. Bladder was intact, contained 50mL urine

10. INVESTIGATIONS: specimens collected

MLC42/25 Exh (1) – 50 ml urine sample

MLC 42/25 Exh (2) – stomach and its contents

MLC 42/25 Exh (3) – portion of liver, half of each kidney

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

MLC 42/25 Exh (4) - 30 ml blood with Sodium Fluoride (NaF) and Saturated Sodium Chloride (satd NaCl)

MLC 42/25 Exh (5) – jeans pant, T - shirt, undergarments

11. **OPINION** as to Probable Cause of Death: kept pending for Toxicology Report from FSL Mumbai.

Time since death: 12-14 hours prior to post-mortem examination

12. **FINAL OPINION:** On perusal of the post-mortem and FSL Toxicology Report, I am of the opinion that deceased Ms Namrata Thorat died due to complications of carbolic acid (phenol) poisoning.

Signed: Dr. V.V. Harsh

Date: 22nd June 2025

Bhabha Hospital Post Mortem Centre

Seal

nyayaavalokan
2025-26

EXHIBIT NO. 4:

CHEMICAL ANALYSER - TOXICOLOGY REPORT

MLC Case No: 42/25

FSL Case No: TOX 139/25

Date: 23rd May, 2025.

Total No. of pages: Two.

To: The CMO

Bhabha Hospital Post Mortem Centre
Mumbai

1. Reg. No: 321/2025

Date: 27th May 2025

2. No. of exhibits received: 5

P.S. : Mahim

3. C.R. No: 226/2025

U/s: BNS 108

4. Mode of Receipt:

Date of Receipt: 23.5.2025

5. Condition of parcel(s) / seal(s): *One parcel, seals intact as per copy sent*

6. Description of article(s) contained in the parcel(s):

- MLC 42/25 Exh (1) – *one vial labelled deceased Namrata Thorat urine sample*
- MLC 42/25 Exh (2) – *one bottle labelled deceased Namrata Thorat stomach and its contents*
- MLC 42/25 Exh (3) – *one bottle labelled deceased Namrata Thorat portion of liver and half each kidney*
- MLC 42/25 Exh (4) – *one vial labelled deceased Namrata Thorat blood 30 mL in sodium fluoride and saturated sodium chloride*
- MLC 42/25 Exh (5) – *one parcel labelled jeans pant, yellow t-shirt, white undergarment of deceased Namrata Thorat*

7. Method of Examination for Carbolic Acid (Phenol)

- a. *Smell*
- b. *Colour of specimen*
- c. *10% Ferric Chloride Test*

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

| Exhibit | Tests | Observation |
|----------------------------|--|---|
| Exh (1) – urine | Smell – typical Colour – dark green, black Ferric chloride test | Carbolic acid smell Phenol group in urine Blue colour = positive for phenol |
| Exh (2) – stomach contents | Smell – carbolic acid Colour – dark brownish, discoloured Ferric chloride test | Blue colour with ferric chloride |
| Exh (3) – viscera | Smell – carbolic acid | |
| Exh (4) – blood | Smell – carbolic acid Ferric chloride test | Blue colour with Ferric chloride |
| Exh (5) – T-shirt | Smell of carbolic acid | |

8. **RESULTS OF ANALYSIS:** All exhibits MLC 42/25 Exh. (1), (2), (3), and (4) showed presence of carbolic acid (phenol). MLC 42/25 Exh (5) only yellow t-shirt having a stain on the right shoulder region showed smell of carbolic acid (phenol).

9. Analysis started on: 24.May.2025

10. Analysis completed on: 27.May.2025

11. Analysed by: Sd./(Sunil Ingale)

Assistant Chemical Analyser in Government

Forensic Science Laboratories, Mumbai

✓ Advance copy to Sr. Police Inspector, Mahim Police Station, Mumbai 16

Note: 1. Results related only to the exhibits tested

2. After examination: biological materials will be disposed of and exhibits should be removed within 15 days from the receipt of the report.

EXHIBIT NO. 5

CHEMICAL ANALYSER - TOXICOLOGY REPORT

CR #: 226/2025

FSL Case No: TOX 140/25

Date: 24th May 2025

Total No. of pages: *Two*

To: Sr. Police Inspector

Mahim Police Station

Mumbai.

1. Ref No: 321/2025 Date: 27th May 2025
2. No. of exhibits received: two P.S. : Mahim
3. C.R. No: 226/2025 U/s: BNS 108
4. Mode of Receipt: PC 28934 Date of Receipt: 23.5.2025
5. Condition of parcel(s) / seal(s): Two parcels, seals intact as per copy sent
6. Description of article(s) contained in the parcels:
CR#226/2025 Exh (A) - one piece blue bedsheet cutting with large white stain of vomitus seized from bedding of Ms Namrata Thorat
CR#226/2025 Exh (B) - one empty bottle of 'Madhu Phenol' with cap.
7. Method of Examination for Carboic Acid (Phenol)
 - a. Smell
 - b. Colour of specimen
 - c. 10% Ferric Chloride Test

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

12. Results of Analysis: **CR#226/2025 Exh (A)** shows smell of carbolic acid.
CR#226/2025 Exh (B) contents identified as carbolic acid.
13. Analysis started on: 24.May.2025
14. Analysis completed on: 27.May.2025
15. Analysed by: *Sd./ (Sunil Ingale)*
Assistant Chemical Analyser in Government
Forensic Science Laboratories, Mumbai

✓Advance copy to Sr. Police Inspector, Mahim Police Station, Mumbai 16

- Note: 1. Results related only to the exhibits tested
2. After examination: biological materials will be disposed of and exhibits should be removed within 15 days from the receipt of the report

2025-26

LETTER FROM RUPESH SANJAY ATHALYE

15.5. '25

My darling Namrata,

Its 4 am and I cannot sleep because I do not know how to tell you this after all that you are going through. I am a coward and cannot bear to tell you this face-to-face because I know how it will hurt you.

Firstly, I hope you know how much I love you.

I want to acknowledge how brave you have been in the last year, especially coming to Dr. Priya with me. I know I pushed you too much to visit her and insisted you do it because I love you too much and cannot see you in pain! I think she has helped you manage your mom better in the last few months? I am glad you have Dr. Priya's hand to hold now, and of course Dadi who is the best. Look after her like she looks after you so well...she is getting old and tired.

This letter is to share with you that I got admission to University of Michigan. I also got a big scholarship and so now my Dad says we can afford for me to actually go. I am so excited. I wish I could just take you with me. Your Mom also wants what is best for you, but she has a horrible way of showing it. If you study hard then you could also think about joining me in the US after 2 years when you graduate, just like we discussed.

Please stick with Dr Priya and take care of your health while I am gone. We will see each other every day till I go and I will call you every day when I reach University. I will have to work hard when I get there so I hope you will understand that things will be different. I promise I will come back soon and we will create our world together.

Yours today and forever,

Rupesh

APPENDIX 1:

STATEMENTS OF DEFENCE WITNESSES

DW1 - Mrs. Rohini Mirza

Age: 45 years

Occupation: Artist

Address: Flat 7, Chandan Cooperative Society, Jambli Naka, Thane (W)

STATEMENT: I am an artist by profession. I am married with two grown up children and I live with my in-laws and husband Ahmed in Thane. Malini is my younger sister. We were both brought up in Nagpur where our parents were college professors. We lived a very simple life. My sister worked very hard to build her life and always dreamed of coming to Mumbai and making a name for herself. She was brilliant in college and was selected to represent our college in numerous inter-collegiate fests. She got admission to SP Jain College for an MBA in 1996. She continued to stay in Mumbai when she graduated. She got a fantastic job at the bank. She always said “hard work and brains can get you the money, and the money can get you wherever you dream”! We spoke on the phone regularly. I got married in 2001 and she came for the wedding. We are very close even though we have a 6-year age gap.

2025-26

In 2002 I moved to Thane with my family. We were both busy with our lives but we tried to meet at least once a month. Towards the end of 2003 she brought Jagdish to meet me and said they had been dating for a while and she was planning to marry him. He seemed like a nice person. After they got married he insisted they live with his parents and she help his mom take care of his father. Malini hated the idea of staying at home but agreed because she was keen to start a family. In those initial years they were so happy. They travelled quite a bit. She did some economics course through distance learning from a commerce institute and they were doing well. But after 2006, when Jagdish's dad passed, suddenly Jagdish declined terribly. Malini had a very tough time with his alcoholism and her newborn baby girl, Namrata. Initially she tried to manage doing everything but she really

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

struggled. Her mother-in-law helped her with the baby. Jagdish died in 2009 leaving Malini in debt and she was alone to take care of the baby, her mother-in-law and clear all his debts. I offered to help Malini financially but she refused all our help. She said she would get through. She was always very proud and principled.

Over the years I found Malini changed a lot. The pressure of single parenting and living in Mumbai and bearing all the expenses single-handedly was taking a toll on her mental health. She used to sometimes share with me how tired she was from all the responsibilities. She often told me she had no time to enjoy Namrata's life and her growing up years due to her having to manage all the responsibilities alone. Due to this she and Namrata had drifted apart and were not close anymore. She often lamented that Namrata had stopped sharing her life with Malini. Malini found that Namrata had become very secretive and sometimes rebellious.

Recently Malini shared with me that Namrata had gotten into some trouble in college. Malini was very upset. She told me she slapped Namrata and felt very bad afterwards but she did not know how to make Namrata understand the value of education and opportunity she was being given despite all the hardships Malini had to face. I know for a fact my sister really loved her daughter and when I would suggest that she and Namrata join me and my family for short vacations, she would tell me to take Namrata with us, so she could work longer hours at the Bank and compete for promotions and salary raise that went with it.

I would often argue with her and tell her to take short vacations to relax herself and bond with Namrata, but she would always say that she wanted Namrata to have a brighter future than hers and so she needed to develop a good financial portfolio, so that Namrata could pursue her academic career. She used to constantly tell me that Namrata is not sufficiently focused on her studies and wastes too much time listening to music, playing games on her phone and chit-chatting with her grandmother. I counselled my sister not to be too harsh with Namrata, and I also understood how responsible she felt for her daughter being a single-mother, especially after her husband's demise.

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

When I met Namrata in April this year, when she had come for a week-end stay to my house, I found her very quiet and withdrawn. Upon having a talk with her, I realised that she was deeply in love with a boy called Rupesh, who was exploring his future career in the United States. She was very scared to tell her mother anything about him, but was very keen on going with him to the U.S. Knowing that this was not possible at the moment due to her ongoing academic studies in Mumbai and her mother being very strict about her performance, she was bogged down with all these teenager worries and didn't quite know how to deal with her problems. I soothed her as best I could, but found her very listless and lapsing into long silences. She told me that if Rupesh went to the U.S. alone, he would definitely forget her, which she could not bear, in which case she would kill herself.

On 20th May, 2025, in the afternoon, Malini's neighbour Pratima called me and informed me that Namrata had committed suicide and that her mother-in-law was squarely blaming my sister for what had happened. She also told me that Mahim Police had taken my sister for questioning and may even arrest her. I was shocked hearing this and rushed to Mahim Police Station, where I found that in fact my sister was arrested for abetting the suicide of her daughter. No amount of my trying to tell Sr. P.I. Patil that my sister was just doing her duty as a mother, convinced him. My husband and I through an Advocate managed to get bail for my sister. This incident has affected my sister's job at the Bank and she is presently staying with me in Thane.

DW2 - Mr. Rupesh Sanjay Athalye

Age: 22 years

Occupation: Student, TYBSc IT

Address: Room #110, Shubham CHS, Houdpada Gorai, Manori-Gorai Road, Gorai Beach, Borivali (W)

STATEMENT: I live in Gorai with my mother, father and elder sister. I am studying at C. S. Manchanda College and am in my third year of BSc IT. I met Namrata, who is also a Chemistry student in my college, 16 months ago when we were doing the National College Annual Fest together. We became friends on that project and then after that we continued to meet in the canteen. In November last year I asked Namrata if she would like go out with me, and she agreed. She warned me that her mother was very strict and must never ever know that we were a couple. She told me I could never call her at home, and that she would call me when it was 'safe'. She was afraid of her mother and I learnt from her that her father had passed away when she was very small.

In the course of our friendship, I would often discuss my dreams and ambitions with Namrata. She was well aware that I was very keen to pursue my Master of Science (MS) degree in Information Systems, with emphasis on Artificial Intelligence from a foreign university and that I was trying hard by applying to colleges in U.S., finding out their fee structure, campus accommodation and also attempting to get good scholarships from Indian Trusts set up for helping meritorious students wanting to pursue further education abroad. My father was also helping me by putting out word with various influential persons known to him, to help sponsor my education abroad. Namrata, during most of these discussions would at first become very sad, and tell me that she will be totally lost and lonely if I left her and went abroad and that I should drop the idea completely. I would reason with her that there is no reason for her to feel that way and that she should also focus on her studies and career and seriously discuss her career options with her mother because from what she had told me of her mother, Malini Aunty was always driving her to do well in her studies and

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

make a name for herself. As the months progressed and I started applying to Universities in the U.S. and going for scholarship interviews, Namrata started getting very aggressive with me and towards end February – beginning March 2025, she started threatening me that she would slit her wrist or jump in front of a train, if I should leave her and go abroad. This made me so scared that I even thought of breaking off with her, but then my affections for her got the better of me and I would sit her down, calm her and reason with her not to have such morbid thoughts but to think of our bright future together. However, I stopped discussing my plans to go abroad with her.

On 5th January I invited her to Gorai to my house for my sister Shweta's birthday. She came after I had spoken with her Dadi, secretly, on the phone. My family liked her. My sister though picked up that Namrata was very possessive about me and kept very close to me, and in fact when she happened to mention that I would soon go abroad, she very rudely told her, "Why? people don't study and qualify in India? This abroad business is just a craze and waste of money". Shweta also noticed that Namrata was not mixing with anyone and spoke very reluctantly if she was spoken to. Shweta realising that she was a troubled girl and knowing my fondness for her, helpfully suggested that I should get some qualified help for Namrata if I was serious about pursuing my relationship with her.

In end February, I am not sure what happened but suddenly I noticed a change in Namrata. I think it may have been post all the meetings in college when Namrata's mother was called in connection with her attendance and the college authorities threatened that she may be debarred from taking her final exams. I know that her Mum was very upset with her. I too got busy with my exam preparations, and foreign university applications/admission processes, but I did realise that she was less outgoing, more inclined to stay home, did not want to hang out after college or meet friends and kept telling me not to go to the U.S. The way she would speak and behave made me very uncomfortable and I was worried about the change, since I found that she became very withdrawn also. I spoke to Shweta about it. She suggested maybe I could convince Namrata to seek help, and that she knew of Dr. Priya who was specialising in teenage counselling and had helped one of her friends snap out of a

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

depression. She suggested that maybe I could take Namrata to see her. I spoke with Namrata. She said she did not want to go.

Finally, after almost two weeks of pushing her, she agreed to go see Dr. Priya on 16th March. I went along with her. Dr Priya spent over 1.5 hrs with Namrata. When Namrata came out, I could see she had been crying. I was concerned. I paid for the session and we left. Namrata spoke very little on the way home. I asked if she was glad we came. She said yes. Over the next few days she was able to share with me that Dr Priya had asked her about the early years and her father. She said she felt much lighter after the session and would probably like to go again.

Over the next few days, with exams and final projects, both of us were very busy and I did not refer to the visit again. On 28th March, just after our last paper, I persuaded Namrata to visit Dr Priya again as she was struggling with the situation at home and her mother's indifference. I once again called and made the appointment. I took Namrata and again much against her wishes, and also paid for the session. After this session, since Namrata seemed to be more emotionally stable, I suggested she should do regular weekly sessions and that I could help finance it, to which she responded that she would see.

Namrata went to see Dr. Priya alone on 13th April, however, I could not go as I was busy. On 15th May I received my admission email. It was 2 am in the morning. Namrata and I had just hung up from speaking on the phone, as we did every night. I was very excited and my first instinct was to call her but I knew she would be upset so I chose to write a letter to her instead.

Everything would change once I left and I was concerned about her. I wanted to speak to her Mum or Dadi also about the therapy sessions and ask them to help her continue. But when we met at college and I gave her the letter she had a full break down and cried and was upset with me for leaving her. She called my shifting very selfish. I assured her that I was going to be around a lot more all summer and I would only be leaving in August, but she was not ready to hear anything and just ran off. When I tried to call her to check on her

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

she refused to take my calls or answer my Whatsapp messages. She barely spoke with me after that day.

On the 19th May, we were to go to college to get our results. I knew how nervous Namrata was, so again I reached out on 18th night and asked her if she would like to go together. She did not take my call or read my messages.

I met her in college on the 19th morning. She seemed quiet, distracted, did not speak with anyone. I know her roll number so I checked the results and saw she had done very badly in one paper. I approached her to speak and reassure her as I knew she would be in difficulty reporting these results at home. She told me to “leave her alone” and that I was no longer going to have to deal with her and her problems, that, “I should go off and live my new beautiful life”. I was very hurt by what I thought was an unfair accusation, especially after all we had been through together. But she refused to stop and talk, she just left for home in a rickshaw. I could see she was crying. I kept phoning to check on her all day and night but she did not take my calls or respond to my messages.

I was devastated when I learnt about Namrata's death two/three days later, when her Dadi called me. My admission into University of Michigan is uncertain at present due to the prevailing U.S. Government Visa policies concerning foreign students. So as not to waste an academic year, my parents and I decided that I should pursue my Masters in Mumbai, which I am presently doing.

A few months after Namrata's death, Malini Aunty called me one day and asked to see me. I went to her sister's house in Thane, where she currently resides. Since we had never met each other before, after preliminary introductions and an emotional exchange, we spoke about Namrata and myself, our close bond and sessions with Dr. Priya. She then showed me the letter I had last written to Namrata which she had found in Namrata's desk after her death and asked me if I would be willing to come and depose at her trial which she was facing for supposedly abetting her daughter's suicide. I agreed to depose, so she handed over the Letter to me.

DW3 - Dr. Priya Mani

Age: 28 years

Occupation: Teen Counsellor

Address: Flat # 403 Lotus Building, Opp. Orlem Church, Bandra (W), Mumbai

STATEMENT: I am a counsellor and have been in practice for the past 4 years. I specialize in counselling teenagers which are particularly difficult years in today's world. I first met Namrata Thorat on 16th March 2025. A young man Rupesh made the appointment on her behalf. He accompanied her to the meeting. After about 10 mins of introductions and discussion, when I could see Namrata was a little more comfortable, I asked Rupesh to step out so we could talk further.

I recall in that session Namrata gradually opened up about her depression and her sense of hopelessness. She repeatedly said "nobody wants me, I am a nuisance, what's the point?" In my professional opinion, she seemed very unhappy and I allowed her to speak and unload. She cried a lot during this meeting. Finally, after 1.5 hrs I suggested we conclude and that she was free to come and meet me again the following week. She did not commit. Her friend Rupesh made the payment on her behalf and he assured me they would be back soon. I was not overly concerned after the meeting, or else I would have cautioned Mr Rupesh. I did not hear back from them the following week. I left it, as in counselling you never push for sessions, you wait till the person approaches, as they need to be ready to engage.

I heard from Mr Rupesh once again on 22nd March, requesting an appointment for Namrata. Since I was in a training all week, I gave them the earliest slot I had available. It was on 28th March. They both came. Again during this meeting he waited outside while Namrata and I spoke. She shared some instances at home where she had tried to use techniques I had taught her to help with her emotions and feelings of worthlessness and it had helped a bit which is why she was back. I let her speak a lot that day. She spoke mostly about her father and her grandmother. Again Mr Rupesh paid for her session, and they made the next appointment before leaving. She informed me that since she had limited money she would like to meet

14th Nyayaavalokan Trial Advocacy and Judgment Writing Competition, 2025-26

alternate weeks. I said that was fine, whatever suited her could be done. We made the appointment for 13th April.

On 13th April, when Namrata came for a session again, she seemed more cheerful and open. While we were speaking, this time mostly about her mother, her mood started to change. She told me her mother did not love her and was only concerned about her academic performance and not her well-being. She firmly told me that even if she were to die, despite being the only child of her parents, it would make no difference to her mother, as she had indicated that several times. I counselled her at length and patiently tried to explain to her the reason for her mother's concern and impressed upon her that these were words spoken in anger and frustration, but she stubbornly believed her mother would be happier if she was out of her life. I thought that maybe I should speak privately to Mrs. Thorat also about her approach towards Namrata. But I never did. Towards the end of the meeting I suggested she may want to look into some sort of medication, for a short while, to help her stabilize her moods. I told her I could not prescribe the medicines myself but I could guide her to a psychiatrist who would see her, and that the two treatments together would help her. She replied that she did not want to be medicated, she could not afford it, nor could she tell her family about it. I asked if I could inform Mr Rupesh of my suggestion as I felt quite strongly about her need for it. She said she would think about it and let me know. I did not see Namrata at all after 13th April.

A few days after Namrata's death I received a phone call from Rupesh who informed me about Namrata's suicide. He was very distraught when he spoke to me, and I calmed him down the best I could, and told him to come and see me when he felt calmer and more collected. A few months later Mrs. Thorat called me and said she had obtained my mobile number from Rupesh Athalye and that she would like to come and speak to me. I agreed. When I personally met Malini Thorat, I heard her at length about her daughter's tragic death. She told me that she was facing trial for abetting her daughter's suicide and whether I would be willing to testify as a defence witness, having counselled Namrata in her last months. I agreed.